

PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE 17 OCTOBER 2019

APPLICATION NO.
19/P2462

DATE VALID
26/06/2019

Address/Site: 21a St Mary's Road, Wimbledon, SW19 7BZ

Ward Village

Proposal: Demolition of existing detached flat with double garage below and erection of 2 x 5 bedroom semi-detached houses

Drawing Nos: 00 001A, 00110A, 00 200A & 00 202A

Contact Officer: David Gardener (0208 545 3115)

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT Planning Permission Subject to a S106 Legal Agreement and Conditions

CHECKLIST INFORMATION

- Heads of agreement: Permit free
- Is a screening opinion required: No
- Is an Environmental Statement required: No
- Has an Environmental Impact Assessment been submitted: No
- Press notice: Yes
- Site notice: Yes
- Design Review Panel consulted: No
- Number of neighbours consulted: 13
- External consultations: None
- Conservation Area: Yes

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 The applications have been brought before the Planning Applications Committee due to the number of representations received as a result of public consultation.

2. SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

- 2.1 The site comprises a detached one bedroom residential property which is located on the north side of St Mary's Road with garage and garden space. The site has off street parking and several trees. The site surroundings comprise residential plots of varying character and form. Surrounding properties are

residential and the site is located within the Merton (Wimbledon North) Conservation Area.

- 2.2 The existing building has a shallow gabled roof profile and is located in the southeast corner of the plot. This part of St Mary's Road slopes steeply downwards and as such the application site is much lower at the front than at the rear.
- 2.3 The site is located within a controlled parking zone (Zone - V0N) and has excellent access to public transport with a PTAL of 6a.

3. CURRENT PROPOSAL

- 3.1 The application proposes the demolition of the existing building and erection of two semi-detached houses comprising 5 bedrooms. The houses would be arranged over four floors, including basement level.
- 3.2 Facing materials currently proposed comprise light buff brickwork, natural slate effect roof and anodised double glazed bronze aluminium windows.
- 3.3 One off-street car parking space would be provided for each house.
- 3.4 Amenity space for each house would exceed 50 sqm.

4. PLANNING HISTORY

The following planning history is relevant:

- 4.1 88/P1592 - Erection of two-storey pitched roof building in grounds of existing dwelling house to provide parking area and storage area. Granted - 14/03/1989
- 4.2 01/P1787 - Conversion of existing two storey garage/garden store to form a self-contained one bedroom residential unit. Granted - 03/01/2002
- 4.3 13/P3373 - Demolition of garage with flat above and erection on site of new detached 5 bed dwelling facing St Mary's Road. Granted - 18/03/2014
- 4.4 In December 2016 pre-application advice was sought (LBM Ref: 16/P4683) for the demolition of existing building and erection of 2 x semi-detached dwellings.

5. POLICY CONTEXT

- 5.1 The following policies from the Adopted Sites and Policies Plan and Policies Maps (July 2014):

DM D1 (Urban design and the public realm), DM D2 (Design considerations in all developments), DM D4 (Managing heritage assets), DM F2 (Sustainable urban drainage systems (SuDS) and; Wastewater and Water Infrastructure), DM O2 (Nature Conservation, Trees, hedges and landscape features), DM T1

(Support for sustainable transport and active travel), DM T3 (Car parking and service standards)

- 5.2 Adopted Core Strategy (July 2011)
CS.13 (Open space, nature conservation, leisure and culture), CS.14 (Design), CS.15 (Climate Change), CS.20 (Parking, Servicing and Delivery)
- 5.3 London Plan (March 2016) are:
3.3 (Increasing Housing Supply), 3.5 (Quality and Design of Housing Developments), 3.8 (Housing Choice), 5.3 (Sustainable Design and Construction), 6.13 (Parking)
- 5.4 Mayor's Housing Supplementary Planning Guidance (March 2016)
- 5.5 DCLG Technical Housing Standards – nationally described space standard March 2015
- 5.6 Wimbledon North Conservation Area Character Appraisal (Sub Area 4: 'Belvedere' – May 2007)
- 5.7 National Planning Policy Framework (2019)

6. CONSULTATION

6.1 The application has been publicised by means of Conservation Area press and site notice procedure with individual letters also sent to occupiers of neighbouring properties. In response, five letters of objection were received on the following grounds:

- Extends beyond building line of Nos. 21 and 23
- Lack of detail makes interpreting drawings difficult
- Lack of greenery proposed/loss of trees
- Fontage lack depth which means cars are likely to overhang
- Basement report lacks relevant information
- Overlooking
- Loss of value of surrounding properties
- Overdevelopment
- Flood risk
- Too high/loss of daylight and sunlight

6.2 Tree Officer

6.21 Proposal requires removal of all trees on site, which are category C trees. Raises some concerns with the loss of trees with little opportunity for planting of new trees.

6.3 Future Merton – Flood Risk Officer

6.31 There is currently limited information to ensure compliance with policy including the London Plan 5.13, DM D2, DM F2 and the requirements of Merton's Basement SPD with only a product specification provided with no detailed

design on sizing, flow rate calculations or how the scheme will safely accommodate the 1 in 100 year +40% climate change rainfall event.

- 6.32 The lower parts of the proposed basement level may sit within the water table and dewatering maybe required during construction and appropriate waterproofing of the structure will be needed and measures to prevent uplift. The submitted report notes that the proposed development is located on the the local hillside setting and while there may be granular materials, information should demonstrate that the design must be able to re-distribute groundwater flows around the proposed basement without causing a backwater effect.
- 6.33 No detailed drainage scheme for surface and foul water appears to have been submitted with the application in terms of compliance with the London Plan 5.13 and Merton's policy DM F2 and D2. It is not clear whether surface water and foul drainage is to be discharged into the Thames Water surface water and foul network at attenuated rates (greenfield runoff rates). We would seek that the scheme discharges at no more than 2l/s. It is recommended that consideration of installation of non-return valves and a FLIP device is installed on the foul drainage to prevent flooding and back up from the sewer network.
- 6.34 Conditions are recommended requiring the submission and approval by the Local Planning Authority of a detailed scheme for the provision of surface and foul water drainage and a detailed proposal on how drainage and groundwater will be managed and mitigated during and post construction (permanent phase) prior to commencement of works are recommended.

7. PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

The main planning considerations concern the principle of demolition of the building, the design and appearance of the replacement dwellinghouses, its impact upon the character and appearance of the Merton (Wimbledon North) Conservation Area, standard of accommodation to be provided, and impact of the development upon residential amenity, parking and trees.

7.1 Principle of Demolition

- 7.11 Policy DM D4 of the Adopted Sites and Policies Plan and Policies Maps (July 2014) states that proposals that will lead to substantial harm to the significance of, or the total loss of heritage assets will only be granted in exceptional circumstances. The loss of a building that makes a positive contribution to a conservation area should also be treated as substantial harm to a heritage asset.
- 7.12 The site comprises a detached double garage with a one bedroom flat above, which falls within the Wimbledon North Conservation Area. The existing building was built in the late 1980s/early 1990s providing parking area and storage accommodation for No.14 Highbury Road prior to the it being sub-divided. The building was subsequently converted into a one-bedroom flat with double garage below in 2001. The building features rendered brick facing materials and is not considered to be of any architectural merit, making a neutral

contribution to the character and appearance of the conservation area. There is therefore no in principle objection to demolition relative to Policy DM D4. Nevertheless, demolition would not be supported unless, a suitable replacement scheme that preserved or enhanced the character of the Conservation Area was proposed.

7.2 Design and Impact on Merton (Wimbledon North) Conservation Area

- 7.21 Policies DM D2 and DM D3 seek to ensure a high quality of design in all development, which relates positively and appropriately to the siting, rhythm, scale, density, proportions, height, materials and massing of surrounding buildings and existing street patterns, historic context, urban layout and landscape features of the surrounding area. Policy M D4 seeks to ensure that development in Conservation Areas either preserves or enhances the character and appearance of the Conservation Area. Core Planning Policy CS14 supports these SPP Policies.
- 7.22 It is considered that the proposed houses are not excessive in terms of their size, bulk and massing with the application site given its relatively wide street frontage capable of accommodating two-semi-detached houses such as those proposed without compromising the spacious character of the street. The dwellings would for example be located a minimum of 1.5m from each side boundary which means gaps similar to the gaps between other houses are maintained between the proposed dwellings and neighbouring dwellings.
- 7.23 The proposed design approach is considered to be acceptable. The houses would generally be traditional in terms of their shape and facing materials i.e. hipped roofs, stock brick, slate roofs and stone window surrounds, fused with some more contemporary detailing such as anodised double glazed bronze aluminium windows and zinc clad dormers. It is considered that this is acceptable in this instance given the eclectic mix of architectural styles in surrounding properties. The proposal is designed to step down at eaves level, therefore respecting the gradient of the street. Overall, it is considered that the proposed houses are acceptable in terms of design and size and would preserve or enhance the St. Mary's Road street scene and the character and appearance of the wider conservation area.

7.3 Standard of Accommodation

- 7.31 Policy 3.5 of the London Plan 2016 and the Department for Communities and Local Government 'Technical housing standards – nationally described space standard' set out a minimum gross internal area standard for new homes. This provides the most up to date and appropriate minimum space standards for Merton. In addition, adopted policy CS.14 of the Core Strategy and DM D2 of the Adopted Sites and Policies Plan and Policies Maps (July 2014) encourages well designed housing in the borough by ensuring that all residential development complies with the most appropriate minimum space standards and provides functional internal spaces that are fit for purpose. New residential development should safeguard the amenities of occupiers by providing appropriate levels of sunlight & daylight and privacy for occupiers of adjacent

properties and for future occupiers of proposed dwellings. The living conditions of existing and future residents should not be diminished by increased noise or disturbance.

- 7.32 As the proposed houses would comfortably exceed the minimum space standards set out in the London Plan, with each habitable room providing good outlook, light and circulation, it is considered the proposal would provide a satisfactory standard of accommodation. In addition, the proposed houses would provide a minimum of 50sqm of private amenity space required by policy DM D2. The proposed house would therefore comply with policy 3.5 of the London Plan (March 2016), CS.14 of the Core Planning Strategy (July 2011) and DM D2 of the Adopted Sites and Policies Plan and Policies Maps (July 2014) in terms of residential amenity.

7.4 Residential Amenity

- 7.41 Policy DM D2 of the Adopted Sites and Policies Plan and Policies Maps (July 2014) states that proposals for development will be required to ensure provision of appropriate levels of sunlight and daylight, quality of living conditions, amenity space and privacy, to both proposed and adjoining buildings and gardens. Development should also protect new and existing development from visual intrusion.

- 7.42 The proposed dwellings would be located a minimum 8.5m from the rear boundary of the application site which backs onto the rear garden of No.14 Highbury Road. It is considered that the separation distance proposed is acceptable in this instance given the steep gradient of the land which means the rear garden of No.14 Highbury Road is on much higher ground therefore substantially reducing any visual impact when viewed from this property. The closest house to number 21 would project only a very marginal distance beyond the rear elevation of this property, whilst the closest house to No.23 would not project beyond the rear elevation of this property. Although the proposal would result in a greater bulk and mass on the site, this would be similar to existing neighbouring properties and is considered to be accommodated on site without causing harm to surrounding neighbouring amenities. It is therefore considered that the impact on these properties would be acceptable. The proposal therefore accords with relevant planning policies and would not cause harm to neighbouring amenity.

7.6 Parking and Traffic

- 7.61 The application site is located in a controlled parking zone (CPZ V0N) and has a PTAL rating of 6a, which indicates that it has excellent access to public transport services. It is proposed to provide one off-street car parking space at the front of each house. Policy DM T3 of the Adopted Sites and Policies Plan and Policies Maps (July 2014) states that development should only provide the level of car parking required to serve the site taking into account its accessibility by public transport (PTAL) and local circumstances in accordance with London Plan standards unless a clear need can be demonstrated. Policy 6.13 Table 6.2 of the London Plan (March 2016) allows for up to 1 space per unit with 4

bedrooms or more where there is a PTAL rating of 5-6 (the site has a PTAL of 6a). The proposed spaces also have an average depth of approx 4.8m which is deep enough to prevent any vehicle overhanging on the footway. In accordance with Policy DM T3 of the Adopted Sites and Policies Plan and Policies Maps (July 2014) the dwellings will be required to be permit free so that the development does not create any additional parking stress in the area. The level of parking provision is therefore in accordance with London Plan policy.

7.7 Flood Risk and Basement Construction

- 7.71 The lower parts of the proposed basement level may sit within the water table and dewatering maybe required during construction and appropriate waterproofing of the structure will be needed and measures to prevent uplift. The submitted information states that the proposed development is located on the local hillside setting and while there may be granular materials, information should demonstrate that the design must be able to re-distribute groundwater flows around the proposed basement without causing a backwater effect.
- 7.72 Limited drainage information for surface and foul water has been submitted with the application in terms of compliance with the London Plan 5.13 and Merton's policy DM F2 and D2 and it is not clear whether surface water and foul drainage is to be discharged into the Thames Water surface water and foul network at attenuated rates (greenfield runoff rates). The Council would seek that the scheme discharges at no more than 2l/s. It is recommended that consideration of installation of non-return valves and a FLIP device is installed on the foul drainage to prevent flooding and back up from the sewer network. The Council's Flood Engineer has assessed the application and recommends that given the lack of information submitted with the application, pre-commencement conditions requiring the submission and approval by the Local Planning Authority of a detailed scheme for the provision of surface and foul water drainage, and a detailed proposal on how drainage and groundwater will be managed and mitigated during and post construction (permanent phase) will be attached to any approval.
- 7.74 The proposed houses would feature lower ground floors which means there would be some excavation. The site is also located on a hill which means there would be deeper excavation towards the rear of the site including within the garden area. A condition will be attached requiring the submission of a detailed construction method statement from the developers contractor to ensure stability of ground conditions during construction.

7.8 Trees and Landscaping

- 7.81 Policy DM 02 states that development will only be permitted if it will not damage or destroy any tree which is within a conservation area, or has significant amenity value. However, development may be permitted when the benefits of the development outweigh the tree's amenity value.
- 7.82 The application site features 11 trees and 5 groups of trees which are graded as Category 'C'. These trees are located along the site's St Mary's Road

frontage and further back within the site and proposed development would result in their removal. The council's tree officer has assessed the application and has raised concerns regarding the loss of the trees and the lack of any scope to replace these trees given the larger footprint of the proposal.

- 7.83 Whilst the tree officer's concerns are noted it is considered that the removal of these trees is acceptable in this instance. The trees are category C which means they are considered to be low quality and as such have limited value and as such it is considered that on balance the benefit of the proposed development i.e. the erection of two new much larger dwellings would outweigh the harm of the loss of these trees. The proposal would therefore comply with policy DM 02.

7.9 Bin and cycle storage

- 7.91 Cycle parking has not been indicated on the site plan, however, both rear gardens would be able to provide sufficient space for cycle storage and access to these would be to the side of the dwellings. Bin storage is proposed at the front of each plot. In order to capture the details for both storage facilities appropriate conditions are recommended.

8. SUSTAINABILITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT REQUIREMENTS

- 8.1 The application does not constitute Schedule 1 or Schedule 2 development. Accordingly, there are no requirements in terms of EIA submission.

9. LOCAL FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

- 9.1 The proposal would result in a net gain in gross floor space and as such will be liable to pay both the Mayoral and Merton Community Infrastructure Levies (CIL).

10. SECTION 106 LEGAL AGREEMENT

10.1 Permit Free

- 10.11 The development is to be 'Permit Free' in line with policy CS.20 of the Core Planning Strategy, which seek to reduce reliance on private motor vehicles in locations with good access to public transport facilities.

- 10.12 Further information in respect of the above, including details of supplementary research carried out in justification of the S106 requirements, can be viewed here:

<http://www.merton.gov.uk/environment/planning/s106-agreements.htm>

11. CONCLUSION

- 11.1 The demolition of the existing building is considered to be acceptable in principle. The proposed new dwellinghouses provide an acceptable standard of accommodation, and are considered acceptable in terms of design, massing and siting, and would not have a detrimental impact on neighbouring amenity. Overall, the proposal is of a sufficiently high quality to preserve or enhance the character of the Conservation Area and are considered to be acceptable. Accordingly, it is recommended that planning permission is granted.

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION

Subject to a S106 legal agreement with the following heads of terms:

1. That the residential units are 'Permit Free';
2. The developer agreeing to meet the Council's costs of preparing, drafting and monitoring the Section 106 Obligations.

And the following conditions:

1. A.1 (Commencement of Development)
2. B.1 (External Materials to be Approved)
3. B.4 (Details of Site/Surface Treatment)
4. B.5 (Details of Walls/Fences)
5. B.6 (Levels)
6. C.1 (No Permitted Development (Extensions))
7. C.2 (No Permitted Development (Windows and Doors))
8. C.10 (Hours of Construction)
9. F.1 (Landscaping/Planting Scheme)
10. F.2 (Landscaping (Implementation))
11. F.5 (Tree Protection)
12. F.7 (Trees – Notification of Start)
13. F.8 (Site Supervision (Trees))
14. H6 (Cycle Parking – Details to be Submitted)

15. (Bin Storage – details to be submitted)
16. No development approved by this permission shall be commenced until a detailed scheme for the provision of surface and foul water drainage has been implemented in accordance with details that have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The drainage scheme will dispose of surface water by means of a sustainable drainage system (SuDS) at a restricted runoff rate (no more than 2l/s), in accordance with drainage hierarchy contained within the London Plan Policy (5.12, 5.13 and SPG) and the advice contained within the National SuDS Standards.

Reason: To reduce the risk of surface and foul water flooding to the proposed development and future users, and ensure surface water and foul flood risk does not increase offsite in accordance with Merton's policies CS16, DMF2 and the London Plan policy 5.13.

17. Prior to the commencement of development, the applicant shall submit a detailed proposal on how drainage and groundwater will be managed and mitigated during and post construction (permanent phase), for example through the implementation of passive drainage measures around the basement structure.

Reason: To reduce the risk of surface and foul water flooding to the proposed development and future users, and ensure surface water and foul flood risk does not increase offsite in accordance with Merton's policies CS16, DMF2 and the London Plan policy 5.13.

18. No developments shall commence on site until the below documents have been submitted and agreed by the planning officer:
 - i) Detailed Construction Method Statement produced by the Contractor responsible for excavation, underpinning and construction of retaining walls. This shall be reviewed and agreed by the Structural Engineer designing the temporary and permanent retaining structures.
 - ii) Plan showing any temporary works, underpinning sequence and sections of the retaining walls produced by the relevant appointed Contractor.
 - iii) Detailed design calculations

Reason: To ensure structural stability of adjoining houses are safeguarded and neighbour amenity is not harmed and to comply with policy DM D2 of Merton's Sites and Policies Plan 2014.

19. F.9 (Hardstandings)
20. No development other than demolition and site clearance shall take place until evidence has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority confirming that the development will achieve a CO2 reduction of not less than a 19% improvement on Part L Regulations 2013, and internal water usage rates of no greater than 105 litres per person per day.

Reason: To ensure that the development achieves a high standard of sustainability and makes efficient use of resources and to comply with the following Development Plan policies for Merton: policy 5.2 of the London Plan 2011 and policy CS15 of Merton's Core Planning Strategy 2011.

21. No part of the development hereby approved shall be occupied until evidence has been submitted to the council confirming that the development has achieved not less than the CO2 reductions (ENE1), internal water usage (WAT1) standards equivalent to Code for Sustainable Homes level 4. Evidence requirements are detailed in the "Schedule of evidence Required for Post Construction Stage from Ene1 & Wat1 of the Code for Sustainable Homes Technical Guide. Evidence to demonstrate a 25% reduction compared to 2010 part L regulations and internal water usage rats of 105l/p/day must be submitted to, and acknowledged in writing by the Local Planning Authority, unless otherwise agreed in writing.

Reason: To ensure that the development achieves a high standard of sustainability and makes efficient use of resources and to comply with the following Development Plan policies for Merton: policy 5.2 of the London Plan 2011 and policy CS15 of Merton's Core Planning Strategy 2011.

22. Prior to first occupation of the dwellings hereby permitted, the second floor side facing dormer windows in each dwelling shall be glazed with obscure glazing and thereafter retained.

Reason

In the interests of neighbouring amenities of the area, in accordance with Policy DM D2 of the Sites and Policies Plan 2014.

[Click here](#) for full plans and documents related to this application

This page is intentionally left blank